

DECISION AUDIT FORM

For use by Assistant Directors in Exercising (Category 3) or delegated powers
– (Protocol For Officer Delegation)

**DEPARTMENT: NEIGHBOURHOODS AND REGENERATION – Traffic and
Transportation Team**

14 February 2011

DECISION: - Hackney Car Club Scheme Bay Creation Authorisation

Agree to:-

1. Give approval to proceed with advertising the Traffic Management Orders to allow the conversion of existing parking places and limited sections of waiting restriction to designated car club parking places in Banbury Road, Bache's Street, Clifton Grove, Cornthwaite Road, Jenner Road, Alkham Road, St Kilda's Road, Moundfield Road, Linthorpe Road, Lawford Rd, Hemsworth Street, Lavender Grove, Lavell Street, Barbauld Road, Lavers Road, Leonard Street, Lee Street, Mortimer Road, Rushmore Road, Albion Drive, Nile Street, Clarence Road and Murray Grove.
2. Give approval to overrule the written objections received having given reasonable consideration to the case and to write back to the residents stating the grounds for not upholding them.
3. Give approval to proceed with the introduction of Car Club Bays listed above.

Reason:-

The introduction of car club bays at the locations detailed above will provide additional designated bays as part of our Hackney Car Club Scheme.

There are four key reasons why we are developing this scheme in Hackney:

- to relieve parking pressures within the borough;
- to reduce the reliance on the private motor-vehicle by residents and businesses;
- to improve the level of social inclusion experienced by residents who cannot afford their own car; and
- it is a mayoral priority and manifesto commitment.

The Hackney Car Club Scheme is part of our wider work to increase opportunities for everyone in the borough and to make the borough a safer, cleaner and greener place. It is included in the Hackney Transport Strategy,

Local Implementation Plan and Parking and Enforcement Plan which are the strategic transport and parking documents for the borough.

To continue to deliver this scheme we are proposing to change a number of Permit / Pay and Display parking bays to designated Car Club parking bays. These bays, spread across the borough, will be reserved especially for the Car Club cars and will operate at all times.

BACKGROUND

- Streetcar is the operator and was appointed by Hackney in 2007 to provide the Car Club service;
- 24 locations for car club bays have been identified in 2010/2011 by Streetcar, Parking Services and Traffic & Transportation, to accommodate a maximum of 47 car club vehicles. Site inspections were undertaken by transport planning and engineers to ensure the chosen locations were as suitable as possible;
- Site visits to these locations involving Streetcar and Traffic and Transportation representatives were completed on 2 August 2010; and
- It is proposed to have all agreed bays operational by March 2011.

PUBLIC CONSULTATION

Consultation on the proposed Car Club bays took place between 29 December 2010 and 24 January 2011 for a total of 26 days. The consultation period was extended by an additional three days to Thursday 27th January 2011 to allow for those response posted on the last days of the consultation period. Consultation leaflets and information packs were posted prior to Christmas to properties in close proximity to the proposed bay locations as those most likely be affected by the changes. See **Attachment 1** for an example of the sent material. Residents were provided with at least 26 days to make comments on the proposed changes and return the questionnaire. Lastly, the Consultation Finder webpage was updated on the 29th of December to include details on the consultation and closing dates for submissions.

An overview of comments made on the proposed changes by location is shown in the table below. From a total of 1707 consultees, 219 responses were received within the consultation period, which equates to a response rate of 13%. In terms of support for the car club scheme as a whole 67% (146) respondents are in favour of the scheme with 30% (66) being against the scheme and the remaining 3% (7) providing no response.

With respect to a location by location response 45% (98) were in support and (55%) 121 objected. Table 1.1 outlines the responses by location.

Ref.	Location	Number consulted	Responses	Support	Objections
H01	Banbury Road	145	4 (3%)	3	1
H02	Cornthwaite Rd	59	4 (7%)	2	2
H03	Jenner Rd	83	16 (19%)	6	10
H04	Alkham Rd	98	6 (6%)	3	3
H05	Lynmouth Rd	30	22 (73%)	1	21
H06	St Kilda's Rd	69	8 (12%)	3	5
H07	Moundfield Rd	24	5 (21%)	2	3
H08	Linthorpe Rd	68	8 (12%)	4	4
H09	Bache's St	30	5 (17%)	0	5
H10	Lawford Rd	31	2 (6%)	0	2
H11	Hemsworth St	39	5 (13%)	2	3
H12	Clifton Grv	78	14 (18%)	3	11
H13	Lavender Grv	50	4 (8%)	3	1
H14	Mortimer Rd	57	18 (32%)	5	13
H15	Lavell St	183	35 (19%)	18	17
H16	Barbould Rd	49	10 (20%)	5	5
H17	Lavers Rd	73	10 (14%)	6	4
H18	Leonard St	82	9 (11%)	6	3
H19	Lee St	91	11 (12%)	11	0
H20	Rushmore Rd	93	8 (9%)	5	3
H21	Albion Drive	43	8 (19%)	5	3
H22	Nile St	31	0 (0%)	0	0
H23	Clarence Rd	117	2 (2%)	2	0
H24	Murray Grv	84	4 (5%)	2	2
	General enquiries	-		-	-
	TOTAL	1707	219 (13%)	98	121

Table 1.1: Consultation Responses Overview

Locations not being introduced as a result of consultation feedback

The following location will not be implemented during the 2010/11 Car Club roll out phase due to the reasons outlined below.

H05 Lynmouth Road – 22 responses, 21 objectors, 1 supporter

The location proposed on Lynmouth Road received a high response rate and a high percentage of these were objections. A signed petition was sent in by 13 residents to show the number of people objecting to the scheme. The Ward Councillor contacted Streetscene and a site inspection was held to determine a more appropriate location for the proposed bay. A more appropriate location has been determined and will be consulted on separately and brought forward in the future.

The location was objected to for the following reasons:

- High levels of parking stress for the residents with many residents already parking in adjacent streets. It is noted that a controlled parking zone was proposed in this area but was rejected by residents;
- The nearby Lynmouth Residential Estate now charges for parking and hence many estate residents are parking in the area;

Where applicable the above concerns will be forwarded to the Council's Parking Service for consideration and action where possible.

Locations requiring further mention

Below is a specific comment regarding each location with a significant amount of objections in comparison to responses of support. Comments A) and B) below are general comments that relate to the majority of the locations.

A) The majority of the following locations listed below had objections relating to high parking stress. Car clubs have been shown to reduce parking stress in the medium - long term and this is part of the reason why the Council is supportive of the scheme in conjunction with other measures such as implementing controlled parking zones. The 2009/2010 Carplus Annual Members Report indicated that 25% of members sold a car as a direct result of joining a car club and consequently each car club vehicle is calculated to remove at least 11 private vehicles off the road.

B) The consultation proposed locating two bays at each location as has generally been the practice previously. Given the feedback from the consultation raising concerns about the parking stress in these areas, and following discussions with Streetcar on the rollout of additional vehicles it is proposed to amend the provision to implement only a single bay at each site reducing the scheme's overall impact. Additional bays could be considered in the future based on usage and growth in demand.

H02 Cornthwaite Road - 4 responses, 2 objectors, 2 supporters. Acknowledging the small number of objections and points A) and B) above it is considered appropriate to proceed with the implementation of this bay.

H03 Jenner Road - 16 responses, 10 objectors, 6 supporters. 11 (69%) of the 16 respondents are in favour of the car club scheme as a whole. Given paragraphs A) and B) above, it is therefore considered appropriate to include a car club bay at this location.

H06 St Kilda's Road - 8 responses, 5 objectors, 3 supporters. As with Jenner Road above, it is therefore considered appropriate to include a car club bay at this location.

H07 Moundfield Road - 5 responses, 3 objectors, 2 supporters. Two of the four respondents are in support of the car club scheme as a whole. One objector identified the road width which has been confirmed by our engineers as being adequate and a second household objected to the scheme on the

basis that it would bring strangers to the area. Given paragraphs A) and B) above, it is therefore considered appropriate to include a car club bay at this location.

H08 Linthorpe Road - 8 responses, 4 objectors, 4 supporters. No consistent objection was received from the 4 objectors, however two objectors mentioned the following individually:

- There is no need for the scheme; and
- High parking stress in the area.

Given paragraphs A) and B) above, it is considered appropriate to proceed with the implementation of this bay.

H09 Bache's Street - 5 responses, 5 objectors, no supporters. One household wrote an extensive letter about several issues in the area relating to parking and parking restrictions and these are to be passed onto Parking Services. The other four objections provided no reasoning for their objections. Given paragraphs A) and B) above, it is considered appropriate to proceed with the implementation of this bay.

H10 Lawford Road - 2 responses, 2 objectors, no supporters. Given paragraphs A) and B) above, it is considered appropriate to include a car club bay at this location.

H11 Hemsworth Street - 5 responses, 3 objectors, 2 supporters. An email was received from the Priest in Charge at St Anne's Church, Hoxton. The letter outlined concern over the conversion of the business bays (which are unrestricted on a Sunday) to car club bays (which may be occupied on a Sunday). At present the Priest believes that on occasions mobility impaired users park in these spaces which are conveniently located near to the church. As noted two bays were consulted on at this location and it is proposed to only implement one bay which should still allow some provision for disabled parking. Giving consideration to the churches response, it is still considered appropriate to include a car club bay at this location.

H12 Clifton Grove – 14 responses, 11 objectors, 3 supporters. 8 (57%) of the 14 respondents believe that car clubs on the whole is a good idea.

The objections can be summarised as follows:

- High levels of parking stress for the residents with many residents already parking in adjacent streets;
- Two disabled spaces on Graham Road are perceived to be underused and will add to the lack of parking issue;
- The street is short in length and leads to an estate which limits the amount of available kerb side space in the area. Non-estate residents are not permitted to park on the estate.

Given paragraphs A) and B) above, it is therefore considered appropriate to include a car club bay at this location. The need to review the usage of the disabled bays on Graham Road has been referred to Parking Services.

H14 Mortimer Road - 18 responses, 13 objectors, 5 supporters. The objections can be summarised as follows:

- High levels of parking stress in the area cause issues for local residents;
- Given the car club scheme is a 24 hour operation a concern was raised about noise; and
- There are two garages in the area which use up any available parking supply in the area.

Given paragraphs A) and B) above, it is considered appropriate to include a car club bay at this location. The issue of noise relating to the garages will be taken up with the appropriate department in Council.

H16 Barbauld Road - 10 responses, 5 objectors, 5 supporters. 7 (70%) of the 10 respondents believe that car clubs on the whole is a good idea. Given paragraphs A) and B) above, it is considered appropriate to include a car club bay at this location.

H24 Murray Grove - 4 responses, 2 objectors, 2 supporters. 3 (75%) of the 4 respondents believe that car clubs on the whole is a good idea. One objector raised an issue over the impact of the car club bays on the available parking supply for her small business customers (hair salon). Given paragraphs A) and B) above, it is considered appropriate to include a car club bay at this location.

In all 12 cases it is recommended that the objections be overruled.

General response to Objections

A total of 121 objections were made within the extended 40 day consultation period, the majority relating to Jenner Road, Lynmouth Road, Clifton Grove, Mortimer Road, and Lavell Street as detailed above. Detailed responses to all submissions have been made and included in **Attachment 2.**

Generally the majority of objections outlined parking pressure in the area around the proposed car club location. However as already outlined, one of the aims of this scheme is to reduce parking stress by providing a viable option to people who own vehicles or are contemplating buying a vehicle which will in turn reduce the pressure for on street parking spaces.

In order to achieve this, monitoring will continue to take place to ensure informed decisions about the scheme and bay locations are made in the future.

The objections to the bay locations outside of the controlled parking zones also emphasised the issue of parking intrusion. Although this is outside the remit of the Car Club Scheme and the bay consultation it indicates the need for the investigation of parking controls within these areas to prevent this type of parking pressure. This information will be passed to the appropriate contact in Parking Services.

Timeline of tasks

Mid February – TMO schedule deadline for Hackney Today
Late February – TMO to be advertised in Hackney Today
March – Advertise made orders in Hackney Today
March – Bay implementation
March – Streetcar to occupy bays

IMPACTS

There will be an impact on the number of kerbside parking spaces available to residents, however, with one of the aims of the scheme being to reduce parking stress, this will be monitored, and the support shown in the public notification period and also from Streetcar members over the last two years has been encouraging towards achieving this aim. Monthly monitoring figures are available upon request. It is noted in the six months from May 2010 to October 2010 membership in Hackney rose by 21% from 4,900 to almost 6,000 members.

Parking Services has provided a technical assessment report (available upon request) for the locations within CPZ areas detailing the most suitable location for the Car Club bays based on the number of resident permits within each location.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- The scheme will generate revenue for the Council coming from Streetcar's annual car club parking permit payments.
- Funding has been secured from TfL for 2010/11 for the cost of the drafting the Traffic Order, scheme development and implementation of the car club bays.
- Further funding is to be provided by TfL (subject to successful bidding) for the 2011/12 implementation of the scheme.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Note the contents of the report above and attached;
2. Advertise the creation of the Car club Traffic Order and the 23 proposed locations across the borough; and
3. Overrule the 94 objections made against the proposed car club bays excluding Lynmouth Road.

CONCLUSIONS

I have noted the contents of this summary and the associated documents and agree with the recommendation contained therein.

Signed: - 

Dated: - 22/2/11

Andy Cunningham
Head of Streetscene

cc Councillor Demirci – Cabinet Member for Neighbourhoods
Steve Walker – Traffic & Transportation Manager

Attachment 1 – Example of the consultation documents
Attachment 2 – Responses and Comments